

CONFIDENTIAL

23 September 1953

STAFF STUDYIAC POLICY REGARDING APPROVAL OF APPENDICES
TO NATIONAL INTELLIGENCE ESTIMATESTHE PROBLEM

To recommend a policy regarding IAC approval of the content of appendices to national intelligence estimates.

FACTS BEARING ON THE PROBLEM

- NSC
1. On various occasions and with various degrees of formality the NSC Planning Board has expressed its desire to be supplied with IAC-coordinated supporting data of the sort which has been presented in the appendices to national intelligence estimates.
 2. Between 11 November 1950 and 4 September 1952 the IAC approved twenty-one estimates containing appendices (sometimes called enclosure, annex, or tab). In three cases these appendices consisted exclusively of quoted documents; in six cases, of tabular data only. In twelve cases they included additional text supplementing the discussion within the estimate proper. (See Annex.)
 3. At the IAC meeting on 4 September 1952 there was objection to acting on a lengthy appendix (22 pages in ditto, 8 pages in print) attached to NIE-69, "Probable Developments in North Africa". This material, once part of the discussion in NIE-69, had been relegated to an appendix as not essential to the discussion, but nevertheless of use to the NSC Staff as background information. The content of the appendix had been cleared with the IAC representatives.
 4. IAC-M-81 (Revised) ^[Rev. 1952] records the action of the IAC in this matter as follows:

Approved [NIE-69] as submitted, the appendices to be disseminated with the estimate. With respect to the general question of issuing appendices to accompany NIE's the Deputy Director (Intelligence) of CIA in consultation with the agencies will determine whether an

CONFIDENTIAL

appendix shall accompany a National Estimate, it being understood that such appendices would consist of background information submitted by the agencies in developing the estimate. Although formal IAC concurrence will not be given appendices they should be screened by the agencies and any serious disagreement taken into account.

5. Actually the draft appendix to NIE-69 was published separately in NIE format, but labeled as a Memorandum for the NSC Senior Staff, with the notation that it was prepared by CIA in consultation with the IAC agencies.

6. Despite the decision recorded in IAC-M-81 (Revised), the IAC, since 4 September 1952, has approved appendices in seven national intelligence estimates. (See Annex.) In five cases these appendices consisted of tabular data only. The earliest case, however — the Appendices to NIE-64, Part I, approved 26 November 1952 — involved the informal, but personal, action of the IAC members on 75 pages of ditto text (32 pages in print). The appendices to SE-38 (38 pages in ditto, 12 in print) were formally approved at an IAC meeting, 26 May 1953.

7. At the IAC meeting on 1 September 1953 there was objection to IAC approval of the appendices to NIE-90, with reference to the policy adopted on 4 September 1952. It was agreed: (a) to refer these appendices back to the IAC representatives for review "with the objective of IAC approval"; (b) to reconsider general policy with respect to appendices in the near future.

DISCUSSION

8. Appendices to national intelligence estimates are justifiable as an editorial device for segregating basic data which is needed to support or amplify the discussion, but which would unduly encumber the discussion if incorporated in it. It may be desirable to reduce this practice to a minimum, but experience has shown that there certainly will be future occasions when it will be necessary or desirable to resort to it. Consequently there should be no rigid rule against the use of appendices. At the same time it would be proper to require that their use be clearly warranted in each case.

9. A recurring need for the use of appendices can be anticipated in the projected series of annual estimates of Soviet capabilities of the NIE-64/NIE-90 type. The basic estimates of Soviet

CONFIDENTIAL

strengths and weaknesses which constitute the substance of the appendices to NIE-64 and NIE-90 are an integral part of the subject, essential to its discussion. Moreover, as established in these documents, they underly most other national intelligence estimates. Consequently they require the stamp of IAC approval and cannot be dismissed as "working papers".

10. At the same time it should be noted that the 20 August draft appendices to NIE-90 (99 pages in ditto, including tables) were more voluminous than the Board of National Estimates considers to be necessary or desirable. This bulk was at least in part the result of insistence by the several IAC agencies upon the inclusion of additional data. An agreement that such appendices should be more selective in content and more succinct in presentation would be welcomed by the Board.

11. The IAC action of 7 September 1952 appears to have been based in part on an analogy between IAC action in approving national estimates and a JCS rule that JCS approval of the recommendations in a given paper is not to be taken to imply JCS approval of the supporting argument. This rule is necessary to prevent some obscure passage being cited in another context as binding because JCS-approved. The analogy is imperfect, however, inasmuch as JCS papers are action papers in which the recommendations alone are operative, when approved, whereas the function of national intelligence estimates is to inform and every part of the paper serves that purpose, including the appendices.

12. It is argued (IAC-119) that IAC approval of basic estimates like those found in the appendices to NIE-64 and NIE-90 would hinder or preclude Departmental modification of such estimates for Departmental purposes on the basis of new evidence. This objection presupposes unwarranted bureaucratic and hierarchical rigidity. No estimate can ever be more binding than an established judgment as of a certain date, always subject to modification by new evidence or even by well-founded reconsideration of old evidence. Frequent revision of basic data is undesirable, but justifiable revision of such data by the competent and responsible Departmental agency should not be precluded by the existence of an NIE. If the departure from a published NIE is a matter of precision in detail, not seriously affecting the NIE's conclusions, no prior or subsequent IAC action should be necessary pending the scheduled revision of the NIE. If it is a matter of greater import, a revision of the NIE, or at least the publication of a slant, would seem to be indicated.

13. It is also argued that, insofar as concerns military data, NIE appendices are unnecessary to meet the requirements of the NSC Planning Board inasmuch as the content of corresponding JIC estimates is available to the Planning Board through its JCS adviser.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

As a practical matter, however, JIC estimates are not made directly available to the NSC Planning Board. The JCS adviser, as an accommodation, might indeed obtain from the Joint Staff answers to specific intelligence queries, but such a procedure would be inconvenient for all concerned and would not serve the purpose of making the Planning Board generally well informed in such matters. In point of principle, moreover, the function of the JCS adviser is to provide operational information and policy advice from the JCS point of view, not intelligence. For the satisfaction of its intelligence requirements the Planning Board looks to its designated intelligence adviser, the Deputy Director/Intelligence, CIA, and normally expects its intelligence documentation to consist of integrated national estimates — that is, IAC-approved estimates, not JIC estimates or Departmental "working papers".

14. The NSC Planning Board values the supporting data contained in NIE appendices (a) as substantiation for and further explanation of the generalized arguments in the discussion, (b) for the better general information of its members, (c) as a general body of reference data conveniently available for use in Planning Board discussions. The Planning Board considers that this data, to be of value, should be as well coordinated and authoritative as any other part of the estimate. Intelligence data deemed worthy of NSC Planning Board consideration should be worthy of IAC consideration and approval.

15. IAC coordination of such basic estimates as are contained in the appendices to NIE-64 and NIE-90 is of important value to all concerned, both producers and recipients, as ensuring due consideration of political, economic, and scientific factors in primarily military estimates, and vice-versa. A periodic IAC review of these matters, as envisaged in the NIE-64/NIE-90 series, is essential to the discharge of the statutory responsibility of the DCI for coordination. The DCI and the IAC cannot acquit themselves of this responsibility by the publication of unapproved appendices as "working papers".

16. As a practical matter, it is likely that responsibility for such "working papers" would be attributed to the IAC in any case, no matter what rules the IAC might adopt. The typical recipient would assume that supporting data related to a national intelligence estimate and published by CIA bore an IAC imprimatur regardless of the rubric printed on the cover. The IAC can delegate its authority to the "working level" with respect to appendices, but it cannot escape responsibility.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL**Recommendations**

17. The Board of National Estimates recommends:

- a. That IAC action of 4 September 1952 relating to appendices (IAC-M-81 Revised, item 4) be rescinded.
- b. That the IAC instruct the Board and the IAC representatives to hold the use of appendices and their length to a minimum consistent with the adequate presentation of estimates.
- c. That such appendices as are found to be necessary be acted upon by the IAC in the same manner as any other part of the estimate.

- 4a -

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

ANNEX

PUBLISHED ESTIMATES CONTAINING
IAC-APPROVED APPENDICES

Date published	Estimate	no. of pp. in est.	no. of pp. in App.	type of App.
15 November 1950	NIE-3	10	13	text
21 November 1950	NIE-7	5	10	text
8 January 1951	NIE-14	4	4	tables only
10 January 1951	NIE-18	5	7	text
22 January 1951	NIE-21	3	2	documentary
10 April 1951	NIE-27	6	3	text
20 April 1951	NIE-19	6	1	documentary
22 May 1951	SE-5	8	5	text
6 August 1951	SE-9	12	2	text
7 August 1951	NIE-35	5	1	tables only
14 September 1951	NIE-41	6	1	tables only
7 November 1951	NIE-33	8	3	tables only
22 December 1951	SE-20	3	5	text
26 March 1952	SE-24	3	4	text
1 April 1952	NIE-27/1	7	4	text
28 April 1952	SE-25	3	1	tables only
30 April 1952	NIE-60	4	11	text
29 May 1952	NIE-52	11	7	text
5 June 1952	SE-27	14	4	text
30 July 1952	NIE-55/1	8	4	tables only
10 September 1952	NIE-58	5	4	documentary
12 November 1952	NIE-64 (1)	8		
26 November 1952	Appendices		32	text
11 December 1952	NIE-21/1	4	1	tables only
Jan 1953 3 April 1953	NIE-80	9	4	tables only
16 April 1953	NIE-59	10	3	tables only
24 April 1953	SE-38	17		
28 May 1953	NIE-87	9	6	tables only
4 June 1953	NIE-91	8	4	tables only
12 June 1953	SE-38 App.		12	text

CONFIDENTIAL